

# Recognizing paraphyletic stem groups: A case study in the analysis of eubrachythoracid arthrodires (Placodermi)

Robert K. CARR

## Abstract

Studies on the origin and diversity of vertebrates are dependent, in part, upon a clear understanding of the phylogenetic relationships of the organisms under study. However, the use of stem and other paraphyletic groupings is common in the literature. Following the advent of phylogenetic systematics, a clearer picture of phylogenetic relationships emerged. Despite what appeared to be a panacea for phylogenetic debates, a number of questions remain. Among eubrachythoracid arthrodires (Placodermi), the sister groups Coccosteomorpha and Pachyosteomorpha are well established; however, the relationship of basal taxa remains unresolved despite methodological advances. This instability is explained by three hypotheses: (1) a historical artifact in the definition of characters; (2) missing data; and (3) a byproduct of the evolutionary patterns in the groups under study.

Eubrachythoracids are evaluated as a case study to test these hypotheses. Pre- and post-cladistic analyses are reviewed. The use of historically biased characters represents a tautology, a preformed group is used to define a phenetic character and then the character is used to validate the group. Missing taxa (including author's choice) affect character polarity. A study group of taxa should be bounded by outgroups and higher nested taxa otherwise phylogenetic conclusions may be misleading. Missing characters obviously affect a character-based analysis. Evolutionary effects include tempo and the nature of morphological change. Sister taxa with different rates of evolution show different sampling biases. An asymmetrical loss of plesiomorphic characters within one clade results in an increased sensitivity to missing taxa resulting in paraphyly. This scenario is modeled.

The model and a review of eubrachythoracid basal taxa support all three hypotheses, in that each hypothesis explains individual cases. Historical biases and missing data are recognized sources of error; however, evolutionary pattern has been under estimated as an influencing factor. It is predicted that these sources of instability are ubiquitous among phylogenetic analyses. Recognition of the precautions and increased fieldwork portend a fruitful future for our understanding of phylogenetic relationships among arthrodires and other craniate taxa.

## Introduction

When considering the origin and early radiation of the vertebrates, analyses either directly or indirectly rely on an understanding of the phylogenetic relationships of the organisms under consideration. Often taken for granted, these hypotheses of relationships may be influenced by their history or underlying assumptions, for example, stem groups, as a concept, are pervasive in the research literature. At a time when the understanding of phylogenetic relationships was unclear, they represented ancestral groups from which descendent lineages were derived. The use of stem group concepts has inertia. Current comparative anatomy texts still continue to refer to mammals as being either derived from reptiles, referred to as mammal-like reptiles, or recognized even as a subgroup of reptiles. This is often compounded by taxonomy where historical group names refer to paraphyletic versus monophyletic groupings (thus the current debate concerning the relationship between taxonomy and systematics, e.g., see NIXON & CARPENTER 2000, and LEE 2001, for a recent exchange).

# **The whole contribution can be purchased as PDF file.**

## **Availability**

Generally all our publications are available as PDF files; full publications as a general rule after the printed version is out of print. If you have questions concerning particular contributions please contact us by e-mail:  
[pdf@pfeil-verlag.de](mailto:pdf@pfeil-verlag.de).

## **The PDF files are protected by copyright.**

The PDF file may be printed for personal use. The reproduction and dissemination of the content or part of it is permitted. It is not allowed to transfer the digital personal certificate or the password to other persons.

## **Prices**

Books: Prices are to be found in the catalog.

Articles in journals and single contributions or chapters in books:

10 EURO basic price per order (including the first 10 pages),  
and

0,50 EURO per page, beginning with the 11<sup>th</sup> page.

Page numbers are found in the contents of the publications.

## **Orders**

Use our order form for PDF files or send your order informal per e-mail ([pdf@pfeil-verlag.de](mailto:pdf@pfeil-verlag.de)). The only accepted payment is by credit card. While using the order form for PDF files, your data will be transmitted by secure link (ssl). You also may send the informations informally by e-mail, fax, phone or mail.

## **Handling**

As soon as possible, depending on our business hours and your order, you will receive your PDF file together with the certificate and password by e-mail.

Larger PDF files can be downloaded from our webspace, if necessary.

Your invoice will be sent out by e-mail after we charged your credit card.

To open the encrypted PDF files you have to install your personal certificate after your first order. All PDF files with the same certificate can be opened from that time on.

# **Dieser Beitrag kann als PDF-Datei erworben werden.**

## **Verfügbarkeit von PDF-Dateien**

Prinzipiell sind von allen unseren Publikationen PDF-Dateien erhältlich. Komplette Publikationen in der Regel erst nachdem die gedruckte Version vergriffen ist. Anfragen bezüglich bestimmter Beiträge richten Sie bitte per E-Mail an [pdf@pfeil-verlag.de](mailto:pdf@pfeil-verlag.de).

## **Die PDF-Dateien sind urheberrechtlich geschützt.**

Ein Ausdruck der PDF-Dateien ist nur für den persönlichen Gebrauch erlaubt.

Die Vervielfältigung von Ausdrucken, erneutes Digitalisieren sowie die Weitergabe von Texten und Abbildungen sind nicht gestattet.

Das persönliche Zertifikat und das Passwort dürfen nicht an Dritte weitergegeben werden.

## **Preise**

Bücher: Die Preise sind dem Katalog zu entnehmen. Zeitschriftenbeiträge und einzelne Kapitel aus Sammelbänden bzw. Büchern:

10 EURO Grundbetrag pro Bestellung (einschließlich der ersten 10 Seiten),  
und

0,50 EURO pro Seite ab der 11. Seite.

Den Umfang der Beiträge entnehmen Sie bitte den Inhaltsverzeichnissen.

## **Bestellungen**

Bestellungen sind mit dem PDF-Bestellformular oder formlos per E-Mail ([pdf@pfeil-verlag.de](mailto:pdf@pfeil-verlag.de)) an uns zu richten. Die Bezahlung ist ausschließlich per Kreditkarte möglich. Bei Verwendung unseres Bestellformulars werden die Kreditkartendaten über eine gesicherte Verbindung (ssl) übermittelt. Sie können die Daten aber auch formlos per E-Mail, Fax, Post oder telefonisch übermitteln.

## **Abwicklung**

So bald wie möglich, aber abhängig von unseren Bürozeiten und der gewünschten Bestellung, schicken wir Ihnen die PDF-Datei(en) zusammen mit Ihrem persönlichen Zertifikat und dem zugehörigem Passwort per E-Mail. Größere Dateien bieten wir Ihnen gegebenenfalls zum Herunterladen an.

Der fällige Betrag wird von Ihrer Kreditkarte abgebucht und Sie erhalten die Rechnung ebenfalls per E-Mail.

Um die verschlüsselten PDF-Dateien öffnen zu können, muss bei der ersten Bestellung das passwortgeschützte persönliches Zertifikat installiert werden, welches anschließend auf dem Rechner verbleibt. Alle mit diesem Zertifikat verschlüsselten Dateien können anschließend auf diesem Rechner geöffnet werden.